

 <p>Agreement on the Conservation of Albatrosses and Petrels</p>	<p>Fifth Meeting of the Parties</p> <p><i>Santa Cruz de Tenerife, Spain, 4 - 8 May 2015</i></p> <p>Criteria for listing and de-listing species on Annex 1 of the Agreement</p> <p><i>Secretariat</i></p>
---	---

SUMMARY

Although the criteria for adding new species to Annex 1 of the Agreement were discussed at AC2 and AC3, no formal endorsement from the Advisory Committee followed at those or subsequent meetings. At AC7, there was a request to develop clear criteria for listing and de-listing of species in light of the limited resources of the Agreement, and the large number of potential candidate species. AC8 endorsed retaining six of the original eight criteria presented in AC3 Doc 18 and the procedure outlined in AC7 Doc 20 Rev 2 when evaluating amendments to Annex 1. Although there are currently no proposals to consider the de-listing of any ACPA species, there is merit in further discussion and development of possible de-listing criteria.

RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Meeting of the Parties:

1. adopt the six proposed criteria in Section 2.1 (including the scoring system for those criteria), together with the process outlined in Section 3 to guide the addition of species to Annex 1 of the Agreement; and
2. endorse further development of de-listing criteria.

1. BACKGROUND

The rationale and criteria for choosing candidate species to add to Annex 1 of the Agreement were discussed at AC2 (AC2 Doc 21) and AC3 ([AC3 Doc 18](#)), however, no formal endorsement from the Advisory Committee followed at those or subsequent meetings.

There was a further call to re-examine the criteria at AC7 given the large number of potential nominations (129 species in the order Procellariiformes) and the limited resources of the Agreement. There was also a wish to ensure that the list includes only those species for which the Agreement is likely to be able to provide meaningful collaborative action, leading to favourable conservation outcomes.

Following discussions at AC8, the Advisory Committee decided to endorse the proposed listing criteria and procedure for nominations as set out below, but noted that the de-listing criteria need further development.

2. CRITERIA FOR ADDING NEW SPECIES TO ANNEX 1

2.1 Listing criteria

The eight criteria against which candidate species should be ranked against, using a 5 point scale from 0 to 4, as originally tabled in AC3 Doc 18 was streamlined at AC8 to the following six:

1. Global conservation status (IUCN)
2. Listing within the Convention on Migratory Species (CMS)
3. Level of endemism
4. Migratory nature
5. Land-based threats
6. At-sea conservation threats

The original population size and trend criteria were removed, given that reliable global estimates of population size or trend information do not exist for many species, and given that trend and population size are already taken into account when assessing the IUCN status of a species. Criteria 3, 4, 5 and 6 above take into account the potential for collaborative action by more than one Party or Range State. Together they address the concern of listing only species where meaningful action can be taken within the Agreement, and excluding species which can be managed by a single Party. The use of total weighted scores (where at sea-threats scores are doubled) continued to be recommended as the most practical method of assessing nominations. The scoring system is included in **ANNEX 1**.

The list of species resulting from applying the simplified criteria is presented in **ANNEX 2**. The scores for ACAP species ranged from 17 to 26, with six non-listed species scoring equal to or above the lowest ranking ACAP species. The lowest score for any species was 4.

Nominations which rank below the lowest scoring species already on Annex 1 of the Agreement would not normally be considered as strong candidates for listing. However, the Advisory Committee recognized that the criteria should provide a tool for considering species nominations, not preclude the listing of species, and that other issues, such as domestic priorities, could be included in a detailed justification for listing by the proposing Party or Parties. It is envisaged that the criteria-based scores will provide a comparative overview of which species are more likely to have a strong case for inclusion on Annex 1 of the Agreement.

Before assessing any new listing proposals, the Secretariat and Working Groups will review and update the scores for species already listed on Annex 1, to ensure that any changes in the conservation status, data availability or threat mitigation or management are reflected in the list.

2.2 Taxonomic issues

There is presently some debate regarding the world list of Albatross and Petrel species. At AC8 a concern was expressed that taxonomic revisions also raise issues for Parties regarding species already listed, especially where species are split or lumped. Therefore, any taxonomic revisions of Procellariiformes should trigger a review mechanism for species already on Annex 1. AC8 tasked the Taxonomy Working Group to bring forward a paper and recommendations to the next meeting of the Advisory Committee (AC9) for a suitable list to be used when considering candidate species for nomination and to ensure the Procellariiform taxonomy is harmonised across the relevant international organisations.

3. PROCESS FOR ADDING NEW SPECIES TO ANNEX 1

[AC8 Doc 24 Rev 2](#) outlined the proposed steps in the listing process as follows:

1. A Party (or Parties) brings a proposed nomination to the AC. This nomination would consist of:
 - a. a **meeting document**, stating why or how the species would benefit from being included within the Agreement and include a draft Species Assessment (in any of the Agreement languages) following the format for those species already listed (see <http://www.acap.aq/en/acap-species>).
 - b. any other supporting material, e.g. a Recovery Plan, Plan of Action, etc., submitted as **information papers**.
2. All three Working Groups (PCSWG, SBWG, TWG) review the submitted material as per agreed criteria and provide advice about the proposed listing in their reports to the AC.
3. The Advisory Committee considers the evaluations of the Working Groups, and makes a recommendation to the Meeting of Parties about the nomination in the AC report to MoP.
4. The nominating Party or Parties submit the nomination to the MoP with a draft resolution to add the species to Annex 1 (e.g. see [MoP3 Doc 26](#) and [MoP4 Doc 16](#)).

A nomination would normally only be successful if it receives the support of the Advisory Committee.

4. CRITERIA FOR DE-LISTING SPECIES FROM ANNEX 1

There is currently no process for removing species from Annex 1. The objective of the Agreement is to maintain a favourable conservation status for listed species of albatrosses and petrels. Article I n) of the Agreement states that conservation status will be taken as “favourable” when all of the following conditions are met:

- i. population dynamics data indicate that the migratory species is maintaining itself on a long-term basis;

- ii. the range of the migratory species is neither currently being reduced, nor is likely to be reduced, on a long-term basis;
- iii. there is, and will be in the foreseeable future, sufficient habitat to maintain the population of the migratory species on a long-term basis; and
- iv. the distribution and abundance of the migratory species approach historic coverage and levels to the extent that potentially suitable ecosystems exist and to the extent consistent with wise wildlife management;

Conservation status will be taken as “unfavourable” if any of the conditions set out in subparagraph n) are not met.

At AC8, it was noted that any de-listing proposals would also have to consider if removing the species from Annex 1 of the Agreement is going to result in, or contribute to, the species becoming threatened again. A concern was also expressed that de-listing species which have improved their conservation status (for example downlisted to Least Concern by IUCN) would be premature as those species could be a useful reference to analyse whether the reasons for these improvements may have been related to actions taken under ACAP.

Although there is no proposal that any of the species currently listed on Annex 1 of the Agreement be considered for removal at this point or in the near future, it was recognized that there is merit in further developing criteria for de-listing species, and that these should be primarily based on the listing criteria.

ANNEX 1

The scoring system for listing criteria for candidate ACAP species.

Global conservation status - IUCN	
Critically Endangered	4
Endangered	3
Vulnerable	2
Near-threatened	1
Not Threatened/Least Concern/Data Deficient/not classified	0
Listing within the Convention on Migratory Species	
Listing on either or both Appendices I and II with a subsequent call for concerted and/or collaborative action	4
Listing on both Appendices I and II	3
Listing on Appendix I	2
Listing on Appendix II	1
No listing within the CMS	0
Level of endemism	
Species breeds within more than four states	4
Species breeds within four states	3
Species breeds within three states	2
Species breeds within two states	1
Species breeds within one state only	0
Migratory nature	
Species occurs in territorial/EEZ waters of more than three states	4
Species occurs in territorial/EEZ waters of three states	3
Species occurs in territorial/EEZ waters of two states	2
Species occurs in only one state's waters but also visits international waters	1
Species does not leave territorial/EEZ waters of a single state	0
Land-based threats	
Species known to face severe land-based threats in two or more breeding range states	4
Species known to face detectable land-based threats in two or more breeding-range states	3
Species known to face severe land-based threats in at least one breeding-range state	2
species known to face detectable land-based threats in at least one breeding-range state	1
No land-based threats have been identified	0
At-sea conservation threats (weighted double in total scores)	
Species known to face severe threats in international waters and/or territorial/EEZ waters of at least two states	4
Species known to face a detectable level of threat in international waters and/or territorial/EEZ waters of at least two states	3
Species known to face a severe level of threat in international waters and/or territorial/EEZ waters of at least one state	2
Species known to face a detectable level of threat in international waters and/or territorial/EEZ waters of at least one state	1
Species not known to face at-sea threats	0

ANNEX 2

Scores obtained using the scoring system to assess the suitability of 129 procellariiform species for inclusion on Annex 1 of the Agreement, sorted by descending total weighted score (at-sea threats double weighted). Asterisks and red font indicate species already listed on Annex 1.

Common name	Scientific name	IUCN ¹ status	CMS listing	Endemism	Migratory	Land-based threats	At-sea threats	Weighted Total
Grey-headed Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche chrysostoma</i>	3	4	4	4	3	4	26
White-chinned Petrel*	<i>Procellaria aequinoctialis</i>	2	4	3	4	4	4	25
Grey Petrel*	<i>Procellaria cinerea</i>	1	4	4	4	4	4	25
Wandering Albatross*	<i>Diomedea exulans</i>	2	4	3	4	3	4	24
Southern Giant Petrel*	<i>Macronectes giganteus</i>	0	4	4	4	4	4	24
Light-mantled Albatross*	<i>Phoebetria palpebrata</i>	1	4	4	4	3	4	24
Sooty Albatross*	<i>Phoebetria fusca</i>	3	4	2	4	3	4	24
Black-browed Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche melanophrys</i>	1	4	4	4	3	4	24
Northern Giant Petrel*	<i>Macronectes halli</i>	0	4	4	4	3	4	23
Indian Yellow-nosed Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche carteri</i>	3	4	1	4	3	4	23
Salvin's Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche salvini</i>	2	4	2	4	3	4	23
Tristan Albatross*	<i>Diomedea dabbenena</i>	4	4	0	4	2	4	22
Laysan Albatross*	<i>Phoebastria immutabilis</i>	1	4	2	4	3	4	22
Black-footed Albatross*	<i>Phoebastria nigripes</i>	1	4	1	4	3	4	21
Northern Royal Albatross*	<i>Diomedea sanfordi</i>	3	4	0	4	1	4	20
Short-tailed Albatross*	<i>Phoebastria albatrus</i>	2	4	0	4	2	4	20
Waved Albatross*	<i>Phoebastria irrorata</i>	4	4	0	2	2	4	20
Black Petrel*	<i>Procellaria parkinsoni</i>	2	4	0	4	2	4	20
Balearic Shearwater*	<i>Puffinus mauretanicus</i>	4	4	0	4	2	3	20
Atlantic Yellow-nosed Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche chlororhynchos</i>	3	4	0	4	1	4	20
Chatham Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche eremita</i>	2	4	1	4	1	4	20
Southern Royal Albatross*	<i>Diomedea epomophora</i>	2	4	0	4	1	4	19
Northern Fulmar	<i>Fulmarus glacialis</i>	0	0	4	4	3	4	19
Westland Petrel*	<i>Procellaria westlandica</i>	2	4	0	3	2	4	19
Sooty Shearwater	<i>Puffinus griseus</i>	1	0	3	4	3	4	19
Yelkouan Shearwater	<i>Puffinus yelkouan</i>	2	0	4	4	3	3	19
Shy Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche cauta</i>	1	4	0	4	2	4	19
Cory's Shearwater	<i>Calonectris diomedea</i>	0	0	4	4	4	3	18
Amsterdam Albatross*	<i>Diomedea amsterdamensis</i>	4	4	0	4	2	2	18
Antipodean Albatross*	<i>Diomedea antipodensis</i>	2	4	0	3	1	4	18

Common name	Scientific name	IUCN ¹ status	CMS listing	Endemism	Migratory	Land- based threats	At-sea threats	Weighted Total
Spectacled Petrel*	<i>Procellaria conspicillata</i>	2	4	0	4	0	4	18
Wedge-tailed Shearwater	<i>Puffinus pacificus</i>	0	0	4	4	4	3	18
Buller's Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche bulleri</i>	1	4	0	4	1	4	18
White-capped Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche steadi</i>	1	4	0	4	1	4	18
Flesh-footed Shearwater	<i>Puffinus carneipes</i>	0	0	2	4	3	4	17
Campbell Albatross*	<i>Thalassarche impavida</i>	2	4	0	2	1	4	17
Pink-footed Shearwater	<i>Puffinus creatopus</i>	2	2	0	4	2	3	16
Polynesian Storm Petrel	<i>Nesofregatta fuliginosa</i>	3	0	4	4	4	0	15
Phoenix Petrel	<i>Pterodroma alba</i>	3	0	3	4	4	0	14
Bermuda Petrel	<i>Pterodroma cahow</i>	3	2	0	3	2	2	14
Short-tailed Shearwater	<i>Puffinus tenuirostris</i>	0	0	0	4	2	4	14
Cape Petrel	<i>Daption capense</i>	0	0	4	4	3	1	13
Peruvian Diving Petrel	<i>Pelecanoides garnotii</i>	3	2	1	3	4	0	13
Cape Verde Shearwater	<i>Calonectris edwardsii</i>	1	0	0	3	2	3	12
Grey-backed Storm Petrel	<i>Garrodia nereis</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Blue Petrel	<i>Halobaena caerulea</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Antarctic Prion	<i>Pachyptila desolata</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Fairy Prion	<i>Pachyptila turtur</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
South Georgia Diving Petrel	<i>Pelecanoides georgicus</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Tahiti Petrel	<i>Pseudobulweria rostrata</i>	1	0	4	4	3	0	12
Great-winged Petrel	<i>Pterodroma macroptera</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Collared Petrel	<i>Pterodroma brevipes</i>	2	0	3	4	3	0	12
White-necked Petrel	<i>Pterodroma cervicalis</i>	2	0	2	4	4	0	12
Black-capped Petrel	<i>Pterodroma hasitata</i>	3	0	1	4	4	0	12
Gould's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma leucoptera</i>	2	0	2	4	4	0	12
Kermadec Petrel	<i>Pterodroma neglecta</i>	0	0	4	4	4	0	12
Galapagos Petrel	<i>Pterodroma phaeopygia</i>	4	2	0	4	2	0	12
Bulwer's Petrel	<i>Bulweria bulwerii</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
White-bellied Storm Petrel	<i>Fregatta grallaria</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Black-bellied Storm Petrel	<i>Fregatta tropica</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
European Storm Petrel	<i>Hydrobates pelagicus</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Wilson's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanites oceanicus</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Band-rumped Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma castro</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Fork-tailed Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma furcata</i>	0	0	3	4	4	0	11
Leach's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma leucorhoa</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Swinhoe's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma monorhis</i>	1	0	3	4	3	0	11
Slender-billed Prion	<i>Pachyptila belcheri</i>	0	0	3	4	4	0	11
White-faced Storm Petrel	<i>Pelagodroma marina</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Henderson Petrel	<i>Pterodroma atrata</i>	3	2	1	3	2	0	11

Common name	Scientific name	IUCN ¹ status	CMS listing	Endemism	Migratory	Land- based threats	At-sea threats	Weighted Total
Herald Petrel	<i>Pterodroma heraldica</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Soft-plumaged Petrel	<i>Pterodroma mollis</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Little Shearwater	<i>Puffinus assimilis</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Great Shearwater	<i>Puffinus gravis</i>	0	0	0	4	1	3	11
Audubon's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus lherminieri</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Christmas Shearwater	<i>Puffinus nativitatis</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Manx Shearwater	<i>Puffinus puffinus</i>	0	0	4	4	3	0	11
Kerguelen Petrel	<i>Lugensa brevirostris</i>	0	0	2	4	4	0	10
Ashy Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma homochroa</i>	3	0	1	2	4	0	10
Salvin's Prion	<i>Pachyptila salvini</i>	0	0	2	4	4	0	10
Broad-billed Prion	<i>Pachyptila vittata</i>	0	0	2	4	4	0	10
Fea's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma feae</i>	1	0	1	4	4	0	10
White-headed Petrel	<i>Pterodroma lessonii</i>	0	0	2	4	4	0	10
Black-winged Petrel	<i>Pterodroma nigripennis</i>	0	0	3	4	3	0	10
Hawaiian Petrel	<i>Pterodroma sandwichensis</i>	2	2	0	4	2	0	10
Tristram's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma tristrami</i>	1	0	1	3	4	0	9
Trindade Petrel	<i>Pterodroma arminjoniana</i>	2	0	1	3	3	0	9
Barau's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma barau</i>	3	0	0	4	2	0	9
Atlantic Petrel	<i>Pterodroma incerta</i>	3	0	0	4	2	0	9
Murphy's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma ultima</i>	1	0	1	4	3	0	9
Hutton's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus huttoni</i>	3	0	0	2	2	1	9
Newell's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus newelli</i>	3	0	1	3	2	0	9
Streaked Shearwater	<i>Calonectris leucomelas</i>	0	0	3	4	1	0	8
Guadalupe Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma macrodactyla</i>	4	0	0	2	2	0	8
Markham's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma markhami</i>	0	0	1	4	3	0	8
Black Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma melania</i>	0	0	1	4	3	0	8
Wedge-rumped Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma tethys</i>	0	0	1	4	3	0	8
Beck's Petrel	<i>Pseudobulweria becki</i>	4	0	1	2	1	0	8
Jamaica Petrel	<i>Pterodroma caribbaea</i>	4	0	0	2	2	0	8
Cook's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma cookii</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
Juan Fernandez Petrel	<i>Pterodroma externa</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
Bonin Petrel	<i>Pterodroma hypoleuca</i>	0	0	1	4	3	0	8
Stejneger's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma longirostris</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
Pycroft's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma pycrofti</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
Providence Petrel	<i>Pterodroma solandri</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
Buller's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus bulleri</i>	2	0	0	4	2	0	8
White-vented Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanites gracilis</i>	0	0	1	4	2	0	7
Common Diving Petrel	<i>Pelecanoides urinatrix</i>	0	0	3	4	?	?	7

Common name	Scientific name	IUCN ¹ status	CMS listing	Endemism	Migratory	Land- based threats	At-sea threats	Weighted Total
Mascarene Petrel	<i>Pseudobulweria aterrima</i>	4	0	0	1	2	0	7
Mottled Petrel	<i>Pterodroma inexpectata</i>	1	0	0	4	2	0	7
Magenta Petrel	<i>Pterodroma magentae</i>	4	0	0	1	2	0	7
Townsend's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus auricularis</i>	4	0	0	1	2	0	7
Jouanin's Petrel	<i>Bulweria fallax</i>	1	0	0	4	1	0	6
Southern Fulmar	<i>Fulmarus glacialisoides</i>	0	0	2	4	0	0	6
Snow Petrel	<i>Pagodroma nivea</i>	0	0	3	3	0	0	6
Magellanic Diving Petrel	<i>Pelecanoides magellani</i>	0	0	1	2	3	0	6
Fiji Petrel	<i>Pseudobulweria macgillivrayi</i>	4	0	0	1	1	0	6
Chatham Island Petrel	<i>Pterodroma axillaris</i>	3	0	0	1	2	0	6
Zino's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma madeira</i>	3	0	0	1	2	0	6
Heinroth's Shearwater	<i>Puffinus heinrothi</i>	2	0	1	2	1	0	6
Least Storm Petrel	<i>Halocyptena microsoma</i>	0	0	0	4	1	0	5
New Zealand Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanites maorianus</i>	4	0	0	0	1	0	5
Hornby's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma hornbyi</i>	0	0	1	3	1	0	5
Matsudaira's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma matsudairae</i>	0	0	0	4	1	0	5
Monteiro's Storm Petrel	<i>Oceanodroma monteiroi</i>	2	0	0	1	2	?	5
Fulmar Prion	<i>Pachyptila crassirostris</i>	0	0	1	2	2	0	5
De Filippi's Petrel	<i>Pterodroma defilippiana</i>	2	0	0	1	2	0	5
Black-vented Shearwater	<i>Puffinus opisthomelas</i>	1	0	0	2	2	0	5
Fluttering Shearwater	<i>Puffinus gavia</i>	0	0	0	2	2	0	4
Antarctic Petrel	<i>Thalassoica antarctica</i>	0	0	0	4	0	0	4

¹ The IUCN Red List of Threatened Species. Version 2014.1.